
APPENDIX 12

Appraisal Summary Table

Appraisal Summary Table

Date produced:

9 Nov 2015

Contact:

Name of scheme:	Hereford City Centre Transport Package															
Description of scheme:	<p>The HCCTP is an integrated package of schemes for Hereford consisting of a new link road (City Link Road (CLR)) between the A465 and A49(T); Public transport, pedestrian, cycle infrastructure, and public realm improvements along A465 Commercial Road, A438 Blueschool Street and A438 Newmarket Street; and a new multi-modal Transport Hub at Hereford railway station. The proposed scheme will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Support the delivery of the Edgar Street Grid (ESG) regeneration area, a major mixed-use development, maximising the potential of a significant area of under-utilised land in a highly sustainable location for both Hereford and the county; - Support delivery of housing, particularly affordable housing within the city; - Improve the public realm and the walk and cycle links between the historic city centre and the ESG area, helping to better integrate new development with the retail and other services/facilities located in the historic city core; - Improve walk, cycle and public transport links between the railway station and city centre and the ESG area, consistent with improving health outcomes by encouraging and enabling physical activity; - Improve east-west access between the A465 and A49(T) to the north of the city centre; - Improve access to, and interchange infrastructure at, Hereford rail station; and - Help address the decline in Hereford's traditional role as a regional economic hub, and meet the national agenda for economic growth. 															
Impacts	Summary of key impacts		Assessment													
Economy	Business users & transport providers	The scheme provides overall benefits to business users, with significant saving accrued in the time saving >5 mins category. The net journey time benefits amount to £11.5m. The NPV includes the net journey time benefits and a net dis-benefit of -£0.4m in terms of vehicle operating costs (VOC), giving a total benefit to business users and transport providers of £11.1m	<table border="1"> <tr> <td>Value of journey time changes(£)</td> <td>£11.5m</td> </tr> <tr> <td colspan="2">Net journey time changes (£)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>0 to 2min</td> <td>2 to 5min</td> <td>> 5min</td> </tr> <tr> <td>-£21.3m</td> <td>-£7.5m</td> <td>£40.3m</td> </tr> </table>	Value of journey time changes(£)	£11.5m	Net journey time changes (£)		0 to 2min	2 to 5min	> 5min	-£21.3m	-£7.5m	£40.3m	Moderate Beneficial	£11.1m	N/A
Value of journey time changes(£)	£11.5m															
Net journey time changes (£)																
0 to 2min	2 to 5min	> 5min														
-£21.3m	-£7.5m	£40.3m														
Reliability impact on Business users	The CLR will provide an alternative route for traffic travelling east -west across the north side of the city centre, with consequent re-assignment of a proportion of journeys to this new road from Newmarket Street, Blueschool Street and Commercial Road. The CLR will also provide improved access to the railway station from both the A49 and A465, thereby increasing network resilience and improving journey time reliability. Furthermore, the improvements to public realm along A465 Commercial Street and A438 Blueschool Street / Newmarket Street, together with enhanced public transport facilities are expected to ensure improvements to journey time reliability for travel by all modes of transport.	N/A	Slight Beneficial	N/A												
Regeneration	The scheme will provide regeneration benefits of £147m due to 'unlocked' development in the ESG area. This includes benefits due to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Net private value of housing: The estimated uplift to land values is estimated as a one-off benefit of £6.9m; and - Net external impact of housing development: The value of benefits in perpetuity is estimated as £140m which is associated with the change in land use and the availability of more public space, better amenity and improved urban realm. The net social value of housing and external impact of housing development (£147.4m) exceeds the transport-related external costs (£60.7m) due to this additional housing, therefore resulting in a net regeneration benefit of £86.6m.	Net private value of housing: £6.9m Net external impact of housing benefit: £140.5m External transport costs due to development: -£60.7m Total regeneration benefit = £86.6m	Large Beneficial	£86.6m												
Wider Impacts	Wider economic benefits (WEB) appraisal considers agglomeration to Functional Urban Regions (FURs), output in imperfect markets and taxation from employment as wider impacts. However, their relevance to the HCCTP scheme is not significant as summarised below: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Hereford is not an area that is classified as a FUR (area with high population / employment density) and therefore agglomeration benefits have not been estimated or included; - Labour supply is only really applicable to schemes which bring pools of under-used workers into commuting journey time of vacant jobs – which is not the case with HCCTP; - It is possible to appraise the impact of the scheme on imperfect markets, by including a percentage adjustment allowance to the business user benefits. However this has not been undertaken for this Business Case. 	N/A	N/A	N/A												

Impacts	Summary of key impacts	Assessment			
		Quantitative	Qualitative	Monetary £(NPV)	Distributional 7-pt scale/ vulnerable grp
Environmental	Noise	Estimated Population Annoyed (Do-Minimum): 2,283 Estimated Population Annoyed (Do-Something): 2,276 Net Noise Annoyance Change in 15th Year After Opening (no. of people): -7	Slight Adverse	-£0.25m	The worst affected income domain is the 40%-60% group
	Air Quality	Assessment Score: 2017 - PM10: 94.04, NO2: 1165 2032 - PM10: 27.47, NO2: 294 Emissions NOx (tonnes per year): 2017: 2.3 (0.1 in area of risk of exceeding limit value) 2032: 0.8 +61 tonnes over 60 year appraisal period	Slight Adverse	Value of Change in PM10 concentration: NPV:-£0.12m Value of Change in NOx emissions: NPV: -£0.04m Total value of change in air quality: -£0.16m	Benefits are weighted towards areas with income deprivation. Dis-benefits are weighted towards less deprived areas.
	Greenhouse gases	The scheme is forecast to decrease greenhouse gas emissions over the 60 year appraisal period.	Change in non-traded carbon over 60y (CO2e) -14,961 tonnes Change in traded carbon over 60y (CO2e) -18 tonnes	Slight Beneficial	£0.73m
	Landscape	The construction of the CLR will mean the removal of a small number of trees along Widemarsh Brook. However, this will be offset by the planting of street trees and shrubs as part of the overall landscape mitigation strategy, compensating for any losses and aiding the integration of the CLR with the surrounding landscape and townscape. In addition, trees will be planted as part of the public realm improvements along Commercial Rd, Blueschool St, and Newmarket St. The new Transport Hub has been designed to be inkeeping with the associated public realm improvements creating a greener, more open uniform landscape throughout the ESG area.	N/A	Moderate Beneficial	N/A
	Townscape	The construction of the CLR will result in the loss of open space (although not public) within the Police Dog Training Ground to new road carriageway. However, the reduction of carriageway widths along Commercial Rd, Newmarket St and Blueschool St (which are part of the public realm improvement plans) will enable the reclamation of previous road carriageway land for pedestrian and cycling activities, as well as for public transport access. The proposed scheme will significantly improve townscape in the ESG area with the redevelopment of the area also including new open spaces and park areas, which will significantly improve the character of the area and help integrate it better with the existing Cattle Market redevelopment. Due to these streets being located in the Hereford Central Area Conservation Area, Herefordshire Council are obliged to ensure the preservation and enhancement of the area's traditional townscape, so the proposed public realm improvements have been designed to complement the historic character of the city centre.	N/A	Moderate Beneficial	N/A
	Historic Environment	The construction of the CLR may have temporary visual and access impacts on the historic Coningsby Hospital site, although once the scheme is implemented there are not likely to be any adverse impacts. The Hereford Central Area Conservation Area covers Commercial Road, Blueschool Street and part of Newmarket Street, all of which will be altered as part of the proposed scheme. As these streets are located in a conservation area, Herefordshire Council are obliged to ensure the preservation and enhancement of the area's historical character. Newmarket Street and Blueschool Street are aligned approximately with the former medieval City Wall and ditch. The scheme will retain the existing sections of the medieval City Wall along Blueschool Street, and enhance their setting as part of the public realm enhancements therefore having no adverse impact on the Historic Environment.	N/A	Neutral	N/A

Impacts		Summary of key impacts	Assessment												
			Quantitative		Qualitative	Monetary £(NPV)									
Social	Biodiversity	Any potential adverse effects on the River Wye, Widemarsh Brook and other locally designated sites from the construction of the CLR have been mitigated for within the design via a range of measures including habitat replacement. Other potential construction effects such as those associated with the generation of dust and noise will be mitigated with the implementation of a Construction Environmental Management Plan. The designs of the CLR, public realm improvements and new integrated Transport Hub include the planting of new street trees and shrubs, providing an opportunity for biodiversity enhancement in these specific areas whilst offsetting the impact on biodiversity caused by the scheme as a whole.	N/A		Slight Beneficial	N/A									
	Water Environment	With the use of best practice measures during construction via the implementation of a Construction Environmental Management Plan, no adverse effects on ground or surface water resources are expected.	N/A		Neutral	N/A									
	Commuting and Other users	The scheme provides significant benefits to Commuting and Other users, with significant savings accrued in the time saving >5 mins category. The total value of journey time changes is £43.7m. The scheme will also provide £5.5m benefits to Non-Motorised Users (NMU) as a result of reduced walking times between bus and rail due to the new Transport Hub, reduced walking times due to the relocation and introduction of additional bus stops as part of the public realm upgrades, improved quality of public transport infrastructure, and improved journey quality. The NPV of £51m includes the journey time and NMU benefits and benefit of £1.7m in terms of VOC impacts.	<table border="1"> <tr> <td>Value of journey time changes(£)</td> <td>£43.7m</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Net journey time changes (£)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>0 to 2min</td> <td>2 to 5min</td> <td>> 5min</td> </tr> <tr> <td>-£7.9m</td> <td>-£11.9m</td> <td>£63.5m</td> </tr> </table>		Value of journey time changes(£)	£43.7m	Net journey time changes (£)		0 to 2min	2 to 5min	> 5min	-£7.9m	-£11.9m	£63.5m	Large Beneficial
Value of journey time changes(£)	£43.7m														
Net journey time changes (£)															
0 to 2min	2 to 5min	> 5min													
-£7.9m	-£11.9m	£63.5m													
Reliability impact on Commuting and Other users	As per the reliability impact on business users (in the Economy section above)	N/A		Slight Beneficial	N/A										
Physical activity	The new and improved pedestrian and cyclist infrastructure, in combination with the proposed relocation of bus stops on Newmarket Street and Blueschool Street and the provision of a new Transport Hub, will make the city of Hereford more accessible to NMUs and will encourage further walking and cycling activity. This will help deliver health benefits associated with increases in physical activity.	N/A		Moderate Beneficial	N/A										
Journey quality	The public realm improvements proposed as part of the HCCTP scheme include traffic calming measures, tree planting and the introduction of new and improved bus stops. These measures will result in an improved environment on Newmarket Street, Blueschool Street and Commercial Road for pedestrians, cyclists and public transport users and will provide easier access between the city and ESG development. The proposed scheme therefore is expected to result in improved journey quality in terms of 'Traveller Stress' and 'Traveller Care' for all modes.	c. £2m benefit, but included in NMU benefits under the Commuting and Other Users criteria above		Moderate Beneficial	c. £2m benefit, but included in NMU benefits under the Commuting and Other Users criteria above										
Accidents	The scheme is forecast to reduce accidents on Hereford's road network.	Personal injury accidents saved: 44.9 Casualty Reductions: Fatal 0.4, Serious 4.6, Slight 57.0		Moderate Beneficial	£2.3m										
Security	The public realm improvements include additional street lighting along Commercial Road, Blueschool Street, and Newmarket Street. The proposed Transport Hub will also be well lit. The proposed Transport Hub and relocated bus stops will provide a safer waiting environment for transport users. It is anticipated that the new and enhanced network infrastructure together with improved lighting, public spaces, and better waiting environments will provide a positive impact in terms of reducing actual and perceived risk of street crime. Furthermore, the CLR is expected to improve network resilience and is anticipated to improve response times for emergency vehicles.	N/A		Slight Beneficial	N/A										
Access to services	The CLR will improve access by all modes to Hereford train station, to redevelopment land in the northern area of the ESG, and to Hereford County Hospital. Additionally, the associated public realm improvements and construction of the integrated Transport Hub will improve pedestrian, cyclist and public transport access to the retail, leisure and employment facilities in the Cattle Market, Maylord Centre and the traditional historic core of the city.	N/A		Moderate Beneficial	N/A										

Impacts	Summary of key impacts	Assessment			
		Quantitative	Qualitative	Monetary £(NPV)	Distributional 7-pt scale/ vulnerable grp
Public Account	Affordability	N/A	Neutral	N/A	N/A
	Severance	N/A	Moderate Beneficial	N/A	N/A
	Option and non-use values	N/A	Slight Beneficial	N/A	
	Cost to Broad Transport Budget	N/A	N/A	£41.8m	
	Indirect Tax Revenues	Indirect tax change = Reduction of £1.42m	N/A	-£1.42m	

Note: All costs presented in the AST are in 2010 prices discounted to 2010